

Los Angeles County Museum of Art (LACMA)
Art Programs with the Community

2007-2008 Program Evaluation Report

September 2008

Research conducted by:

Michael Butler
Grace S. Park

Public Works, Inc.
90 N. Daisy Avenue
Pasadena, CA 91107
(626) 564-9890 tel
(626) 564-0657 fax

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction.....	1
	Prior Research of Arts Education Programs	
	Description of LACMA’s <i>Arts Programs with the Community</i>	
	Evaluation Context and Methodology	
2.	Teacher and Student Survey Results.....	8
	Delivery of the LACMA Curriculum	
	Teacher Experiences with the LACMA Program	
	Student Experiences with the LACMA Program	
3.	Case Study: Plasencia Elementary School.....	12
	Delivery of LACMA Curriculum	
	Teacher Experiences with LACMA	
	Student Impact Oral Presentations	
4.	Case Study: Garvanza Elementary School.....	17
	Delivery of LACMA Curriculum	
	Teacher Experiences with LACMA	
	Student Impact Oral Presentations	
5.	Conclusions and Recommendations.....	22
	Program Accomplishments and Benefits	
	Recommendations	

Appendix A: Teacher and Student Survey and Results

Appendix B: Classroom Observation Tool

Appendix C: Student Presentation Rubric

Appendix D: Bibliographic References

I. Introduction

The Los Angeles County Museum of Art (LACMA) *Art Programs with the Community* is a pilot arts education program implemented at eleven schools in the Los Angeles Unified School District’s (LAUSD) Local District 4 (see Table 1 below), in northeast Los Angeles. LACMA’s *Art Programs with the Community* brings the museum’s collection into the classroom with curricula delivered by teaching artists aimed at providing meaningful art experiences for students. The program also provides professional development and curriculum materials for teachers, as well as distance learning lessons.

Table 1: Participating LACMA Schools in LAUSD District 4

Elementary	Middle	Span
Cahuenga (K-5)	Berendo (6-8)	Arroyo Seco (K-8)
Garvanza (K-5)	Irving (6-8)	
Hancock Park (K-5)	King (6-8)	
Hoover (K-5)	Virgil (6-8)	
Plasencia (K-5)		
Ramona (K-5)		

Public Works, Inc. (PW) is a non-profit educational consulting firm based in Pasadena, California. PW has extensive experience evaluating educational programs and was contracted by LACMA to conduct an external evaluation of the LACMA *Art Programs with the Community*. This report presents evaluation data from the second year (2007-2008) of the program.

Prior Research on Arts Education Programs

Although students enter school with diverse abilities, schools typically focus most of their attention on only two (linguistic and logical-mathematical) of the eight intelligences proposed by the psychologist Howard Gardener (Armstrong 2007).¹ In the current environment of “high stakes” accountability and testing, the curricular focus has tended to narrow to English/Language Arts and Mathematics, the two subject areas most heavily weighted on standardized tests. In striving to meet educational accountability goals, many schools have reduced or even eliminated the visual arts from the curricula.

Meanwhile, there is a large body of research on the benefits of interdisciplinary teaching and learning which allows students “to receive and process information in many forms, not just through direct teaching of one subject separated from other subjects” (Hanson 2002). Furthermore, an integrated, multidisciplinary curriculum is more relevant to students precisely because everyday life calls for an interdisciplinary approach to problem solving, requiring the gathering of data from multiple resources (Schramm 1997). In sum, an integrated curriculum allows students to explore connections between disciplines and perceive the relevance of education to their everyday lives.

¹ The others include: Spatial intelligence; Bodily-kinesthetic intelligence; Musical intelligence; Interpersonal intelligence; Intrapersonal intelligence; and Naturalist intelligence.

Against this background, a growing body of literature supports the notion that the integration of art education not only contributes to developing well-rounded students but supports learning in core academic areas. Effective arts education supports learning in core academic areas because art is the product of numerous mental processes such as creative thinking, critical judgment, imagination, and problem solving (West, 2000 p. 178). As such, art develops students' thinking and questioning skills, strengthening their own ability to search for information and solve problems in many types of situations, rather than relying on adults for answers (Hanson 2002). Schubert & Melnick (1997) note that students exposed to an integrated arts curriculum have demonstrated improvements in self-confidence and are willing to take risks in other classes as well. Moreover, arts education provides opportunities for students to grasp content visually as well as kinesthetically, which in turn, provides an additional opportunity for learning to occur.

According to the U.S. Department of Education (1994), the arts engage students and thus provide a first opportunity for learning for *some* students and a chance to learn more for *all* students, which has had quantifiable benefits on student achievement.

“The arts are important in themselves *and* they help students learn other subjects. In school after school, well designed arts education has increased test scores, teacher and student attendance, graduation rates and decreased discipline problems” (Department of Education, p. 3, 1994).

McCarty's study (2007), for example, makes a strong case for how the visual arts provide a foundation for literacy and a way to understand the concept of reading for emergent readers and English learners. In this study, primary grade students unexposed to arts programs typically looked at the first letter of a word and named any word that began with that letter. However, similar students involved in arts education looked at the entire word (just as they would examine an artwork) and attempted to put meaning to the word. Furthermore young emergent readers who studied art were less likely to guess when decoding words or sentences. Illustrations were especially helpful for African American students and students with reading disabilities who struggled with reading comprehension.

Another study (Hanson 2002) used pre- and post-test methodology to demonstrate substantial gains in two areas (math and science) following involvement in arts education programs. This is not to say, however, that an integrated arts curriculum necessarily correlates with improved academic achievement, particularly gains on standardized assessments. For example, in a study presented by McCarty (2007), 3rd grade students exposed to an integrated arts curriculum had a higher mean average on reading tests than students taught with a traditional curriculum. However, the results failed to reach statistical significance, indicating that the discrepancy in scores could not be attributed solely to an integrated arts curriculum.

In summary, research indicates that students benefit when schools support arts education rather than limiting the arts to an “extracurricular” activity or a reward for the gifted. Instruction in the arts may improve academic outcomes, and tends to engage students while also highlighting the relevance of academic subjects to the real world. In addition, exposure to the arts allows students to use and cultivate other talents and provides meaningful experience in the classroom.

Description of LACMA's Art Programs with the Community

In order to help strengthen school art programs and support teachers interested in implementing interdisciplinary, arts-centered approaches to teaching, LACMA entered into a partnership with Los Angeles Unified School Districts (LAUSD) Local District 4 to provide meaningful art experiences to eleven elementary and middle schools. More specifically, the purpose of the *LACMA Art Programs with the Community* is to complement the art program within LAUSD Local District 4, by bringing LACMA's collection into the classroom with the intent of providing meaningful art experiences for students. The program has multiple components (see Table 2), which provide professional development and curriculum materials for teachers, in addition to bringing teaching artists into the classroom and providing distance learning lessons.

Table 2: LACMA Art Programs with the Community Components

Project Component	Targeted Group	Goal	Timeline
Evening for Educators	Teachers	Provide opportunities to learn from LACMA's collections as well as provide ideas on how to incorporate the visual arts into the classroom	Fall/Winter
Curriculum Materials	Teachers	Improve understanding of the visual arts and enhance teachers ability to incorporate the visual arts into curriculum	Fall
Mobile Classrooms	6 th and 7 th Grade	Teach students about the art and culture of ancient civilizations. Meets state content standards for history/social science.	Winter
Teaching Artist Sessions	All students (pre-K – 8 th grade)	Six artist led session in all participating classrooms. Lessons are aligned to meet state content standards for art.	Spring/Summer 2007
Museum Membership	All students	Students can visit the museum at anytime and bring an accompanying adult for free.	Year-round

Teachers participating in the program receive six hours of classroom-based art sessions taught by a teaching artist contracted by LACMA. Teaching artist sessions are typically once a week for six weeks or twice a week for three weeks. During these sessions, teaching artists present students with art pieces from the LACMA collection and encourage discussions around artwork. In addition to teaching students about works of art, teaching artists work with students to create art pieces based on those in LACMA's collection.

Elementary School Teacher and Student Participation

At the elementary school level, a total of 259 teachers and 5,661 students participated in the LACMA program. As shown in Table 3 below, 69% of the students and 73% of the teachers served by the program were elementary (grades K-5). See Table 3 for further detailed information.

Table 3: Teacher (Student) Participation by School and Grade Level, 2007-2008

Elementary	Pre-K/K	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th	5 th	Total
Cahuenga (K-5)	9 (191)	8 (146)	10 (201)	8 (168)	7 (143)	5 (169)	47 (1018)
Garvanza (K-5)	7 (119)	4 (77)	3 (59)	3 (60)	4 (99)	2 (56)	23 (470)
Hancock Park (K-5)	7 (147)	6 (132)	6 (132)	5 (110)	5 (160)	5 (160)	34 (841)
Hoover (K-5)	15 (277)	12 (244)	11 (204)	11 (215)	7 (239)	8 (157)	64 (1336)
Plasencia (K-5)	11 (198)	8 (147)	8 (180)	8 (182)	6 (157)	4 (107)	45 (971)
Ramona (K-5)	5 (96)	6 (120)	7 (129)	5 (101)	4 (127)	5 (138)	32 (711)
Arroyo Seco (K-5)	1 (20)	3 (58)	3 (54)	3 (58)	2 (62)	2 (62)	14 (314)
TOTAL K-5	55 (1048)	47 (924)	48 (959)	43 (894)	35 (987)	31 (849)	259 (5661)

Evaluation Context and Methodology

Public Works, Inc. (PW) was contracted to conduct an external evaluation of the eleven schools participating in the LACMA *Art Programs with the Community*. The evaluation is focused on two key research questions:

1. How are teachers integrating arts into the elementary and middle school curriculum?
2. How are students benefiting from experiences in the visual arts?

To evaluate the LACMA program, PW focused on three key methods:

- Quantitative measures of student achievement
- Surveys of teachers and students
- On-site focus groups and interviews with teachers, students, and teaching artists.

Baseline Quantitative Data

Following up from 2005-2006 Baseline data, quantitative student achievement data (2007-08) in English/Language Arts was examined in order to track the influence of the LACMA program on student performance over time. Summative measures included the California Standards Tests (CST) and the California English Language Development Test (CELDT). Formative measures include Open Court Reading (OCR) at the elementary level and Secondary Periodic Assessments (SPA) at the middle school level.

Key findings from the baseline data report² indicated the following:

- All but one of the schools included in the LACMA *Art Program with the Community* are overwhelmingly Hispanic (average of 77%). Of the 47% of students classified as English Learners, 36% scored at the Advanced or Early Advanced level in terms of English language proficiency, a decrease of 19% from the 2006-2007 baseline.
- On average, schools had an even distribution of students scoring Advanced/Proficient, Basic, and Below Basic/Far Below Basic on the English/Language Arts portion of the CST. The change overall from Baseline included a slight increase in the percentage of students testing in Advanced or Proficient, and a slight decrease in the percentage of students testing in Basic and Below or Far Below Basic categories.
- At the elementary schools, formative assessments tied to the curriculum indicate that students perform best in Fluency 2, Checking Skills and Writing Conventions. There was a shift from Baseline represented by decreases in Vocabulary and Spelling.
- At the middle schools, formative assessments showed that students tended to perform best on test items tied to understanding of reading passages (Reading Comprehension) and basic grammar/syntax (Written Conventions). By contrast, middle school students tended to perform least well on the identification/revision of written text (Writing Strategies) and making inferences based on what they have read (Literary Response).

In sum, these academic results showed that the vast majority of students did not achieve master of standards in English/Language Arts. As such, exposure to an integrated Visual Arts curriculum may assist these students in making achievement gains in their ability to discuss, reflect on, and express their perceptions of artwork and art making in the context of the LACMA program.

² See Butler, M. and Park, G., Public Works, Inc. *Los Angeles County Museum of Art (LACMA) Art Programs with the Community Student Achievement Indicators 2007-08 Baseline Report* (Dec 2007)

Survey Data Results

Public Works, Inc. administered surveys to all participating teachers (K-5th grade) and students (4th grade for elementary and 3rd– 5th grade at case study sites) at the conclusion of the six-week classroom experience with the LACMA program. Teacher and student survey results may be found in Appendix A.

Teachers were given the opportunity to complete the paper survey, or an electronic survey accessible through the Public Works, Inc. Website. Students completed surveys under teacher direction in the classroom. As shown in Table 4, the elementary teacher survey response rate was 49% (N=94 teachers). Elementary student surveys yielded a 52% response rate (N=618 students).

Table 4: Elementary Student and Teacher Response Rates

School	# Teacher Surveyed	# Completed teacher surveys	Response Rate	# Students Surveyed	# Completed 3 rd -5 th grade student Surveys	Response Rate
Arroyo Seco (1 st -5 th grade)	14	10	71%	62	30	48%
Cahuenga	47	20	43%	173	111	64%
Garvanza	22	13	59%	213	139	65%
Hancock Park	31	16	52%	160	68	43%
Plasencia	45	22	49%	443	216	49%
Ramona ES	32	13	41%	127	54	43%
Total	191	94	49%	1178	618	52%

Characteristics of Survey Respondents

The vast majority (76%) of elementary teachers who completed a survey had 6 or more years of teaching experience. An additional 15% had 3-5 years of experience. Thus, new teachers were largely unrepresented in the LACMA program. Most teachers had some experience in art-related training including college coursework in art (42%), professional development (37%), or art history (37%). However, only 14% reported studio art experience and 17% said that they had no formal training in the visual arts.

Among those teachers surveyed, the average class size (self-reported) was 22 students (including an average of 7 Special Education students). Because 3rd and 5th grade classes were surveyed only at case study sites, these grades comprised a smaller portion of total surveys. Among students surveyed, 25% were 3rd grade, 55% were 4th grade, and 20% were 5th grade. Additionally among student survey respondents, 54% were male, 46% were female.

Case Studies

PW conducted case studies at two (Plasencia and Garvanza) participating elementary schools. These schools were selected as case study sites based on their representative demographic population as well as student achievement test scores, relative to the other LACMA pilot schools. Observations of the LACMA lessons taught by teaching artists were conducted in a sample of classrooms grades 3-5. Based on feedback from principals at case study sites, instruments were developed focusing on student oral language development in the context of learning about art. Although the initial intention was to examine LACMA curriculum's impact on student's writing abilities, school administrators felt it was more appropriate to examine impact on verbal skills due to the high proportion of English Learner students. The classroom observation tool, in addition to the student presentation rubric, were developed using the oral language conventions from the California Content Standards in English Language Art along with grade level standards for Visual Arts (See Appendix B and C).

In addition the administration of teacher and student surveys, focus groups were also conducted with a sample of participating teachers and students in grades 3-5. PW convened teacher focus groups of six to eight teachers during lunch period and before school. PW also held student focus groups comprised of six to ten students exposed to the LACMA program. Teacher and student focus group sessions lasted approximately 30 minutes.

Report Organization

Section II of this report describes the impact of the LACMA program on teachers and students at the participating schools as evidenced from survey results. Section III is devoted to a case study of Plasencia Elementary School, detailing the experiences of teachers and students at a representative LACMA elementary school. Section IV presents a second case study of Garvanza Elementary School. The case study sections incorporate focus group results in the discussion. Section V provides conclusions and recommendations intended to assist LACMA and LAUSD Local District 4 in further refining the LACMA program.

II. Teacher and Student Survey Results

Impact on Teachers

Delivery of the LACMA Curriculum

In general, classroom sessions with the teaching artists (TAs) were scheduled twice per week for three weeks, or as weekly sessions over six weeks. Some classes were scheduled for one-hour sessions while other classes were scheduled for longer sessions. LACMA sessions consisted of a presentation and discussion of art, art making, and clean up. Teaching artists were charged with presenting a pre-designed curriculum provided by LACMA, and discussing artwork from the LACMA collection, historical background, and artistic terminology. The curriculum presented was consistent across classes within each grade level. After the presentation of art, students were asked to make their own art based on art pieces viewed. For example, in one 3rd grade classroom, students were presented with examples of abstract and representational art. After the discussion portion of the lesson, students were asked to create their own abstract portraits, cutting shapes out of brightly colored construction paper to build their pieces.

Teaching artists tended to focus on the *process* of making art rather than simply the end result. As an example, teaching artists had students begin with basic shapes when making a portrait. This helped students become aware of proportionality when drawing animate figures.

Teachers Experiences with the LACMA Program

Overall, teachers were very positive about their experiences with teaching artists. TAs had previous experience teaching art to youth, which was reflected in the rapport they established with students. Teachers reported that TAs were well prepared to deliver lessons, however that they would benefit from pedagogical training, e.g., checking for understanding, age appropriate vocabulary, scaffolding the lesson to meet the learning and linguistic needs of students, etc.

As shown in Table 5, teachers reported learning new strategies as a result of participating in the LACMA program (96%). Teachers also gained confidence and were more likely to visit LACMA and other art museum (95% and 94%, respectively). The LACMA program encouraged teachers to integrate art in subject areas such as Social Studies and English/Language Arts in the future (91% and 90%, respectively). Further, 86% of teachers indicated that they were likely to use LACMA as a teaching/classroom resource. Please see Table 5 for further detailed information.

Table 5: Teacher Survey Responses (% Agree or Strongly Agree) (N=94)

As a result of participating in the LACMA program I...	%
Learned new strategies for teaching art in the classroom.	96%
Am more confident discussing artwork with my students.	95%
Am more likely to visit LACMA and other art museums.	94%
Am more likely to integrate art into Social Studies instruction.	91%
Am more likely to integrate art into English/Language Arts instruction.	90%
Am more likely to use LACMA as a teaching/classroom resource.	86%
Am more likely to give students writing assignments that are based on works of art.	77%

Professional Development and Museum Experiences

Overall, teachers enjoyed the various LACMA programming components such as the Evening for Educators, and some teachers reported a desire to learn more about art. Several teachers found it difficult to attend the Evening of Educators, due to scheduling conflicts. Although some teachers reported already visiting the museum on a regular basis, teachers generally indicated an increased interest in going to LACMA.

Table 6 illustrates positive teacher ratings of LACMA program components. Teachers felt most positively about their experiences with TAs (94%) and the LACMA curriculum and supplementary materials (92%). The majority of teachers (66%) felt positive about the Evening for Educators program. However, teachers stated that in terms of scheduling, the program should be slated for earlier in the year, before sessions with TAs. Having such programming prior to LACMA classroom sessions would be most beneficial in scaffolding teachers' knowledge base. Teachers were least positive about the Family Sundays program and Other LACMA-sponsored professional development (61% and 58%, respectively). In regard to helping students and families access the LACMA and BCAM, teachers suggested that LACMA provide transportation via bus from schools to the museum.

Table 6: Teacher Rating of LACMA Program Components (% Positive) (N=94)

LACMA Program Components	%
LACMA teaching artists in the classroom.	94%
LACMA curriculum and supplementary materials.	92%
LACMA-sponsored Evenings for Educators.	66%
Access to LACMA through the Family Sunday's program.	61%
Other LACMA-sponsored professional development.	58%

Impact on Students

Student Exposure to Art and Art Making

Participation in the LACMA program gave students exposure to a variety of artistic media beyond their previous understanding of art as only entailing painting and drawing. Students reported that their view of art had changed and they were more confident in their artistic abilities and interested in learning more about art history and culture. Students especially enjoyed the kinesthetic experience, such as exposure to clay and using their hands

to create art. Throughout the sessions, students appreciated that teaching artists were patient and encouraged students to freely express themselves.

Both teachers and students reported that students involved in the LACMA classroom sessions became more interested in making art themselves. Although young students generally show interest in art, teachers felt that students demonstrated more eagerness in creating art. Students expressed a strong desire for longer or greater number of sessions with the teaching artists. Although students enjoyed the art sessions, some students indicated a desire for more variety in terms of art projects and materials used.

As demonstrated in Table 7, student survey responses indicate that there was an emphasis on discussing and making art during artist sessions. The overwhelming majority (97%) of students felt they were able to make their own art due to their experience with teaching artists and were interested in visiting art museums in the future as a result of participation in the LACMA program. Furthermore, students also indicated learning about the elements of art (89%), how to describe artwork (84%), and the artistic process (82%). See Table 7 for further detailed information.

Table 7: Student Perceptions of the LACMA Program (% Agreement) (N=618)

As a result of participation in LACMA Art Programs with the Community...	%
I learned how to make my own art.	97%
We spent time making art in class.	96%
We discussed art in the classroom.	95%
I learned about the elements of art (line, color, texture, space).	89%
I would like to visit art museums.	89%
I learned how to describe artwork.	84%
I learned about the artistic process (how artists work).	82%
I learned to compare and contrast art from different times or places.	79%
I am able to describe why I like or dislike an artwork.	78%
I learned about art in different periods of history and different cultures.	78%
We wrote about artists or artwork.	49%

Impact on Verbal and Written Expression

As in the results from the previous year's focus groups, students reported that exposure to the LACMA program helped them to express themselves. Students felt that art conveyed emotion and that they were able to not only learn about an artist from his artwork but to have insight into how the artist felt. In addition, students reported enjoying talking about art. Few students, however, reported writing about art. Students also stated that they enjoyed talking about art more than writing about art. Nonetheless, students reported not talking about art much outside of teaching artist sessions.

Table 8: Teacher Assessment of Impact on Students (% Agreement) (N=113)

Role and Importance of Art	%
Are more confident in making art.	97%
Understand the historical and cultural context of artistic expression.	75%
Verbal Expression	%
Are better able to describe works of art.	91%
Are better able to use artistic terms to describe the intent and content of artwork.	84%
Are better able to compare and contrast art from different times or places.	79%
Written Expression	%
My students were better able to write about ideas, observations, or details about their own experiences with artists or artwork.	86%
My students were better able to write about artists or artwork with supporting facts or details.	75%

As seen in Table 8, teachers' assessment of student impact were in line with student responses as most teachers agreed that students were able to describe art (91%) and better able to use artistic terms (84%). Teachers were most positive about students becoming more confident in making art (97%). Although only 49% of students reported writing about art as a result of the LACMA program, teachers indicated that students were better able to write about art (86%).

Museum Visits

More than half of students (59%) reported visiting an art museum within the past 12 months and 52% of students reported visiting LACMA within the past year. As shown previously in Table 7, most students (89%) indicated a desire to visit an art museum. Additionally, almost all students (98%) felt it was important for students to visit art museums.

Student survey results revealed that students who had visited any art museum in the past, as well as those reporting visitations to LACMA two or more times in the past 12 months, were more likely to say that they learned about the elements of art. These students were also more likely to report being able to describe why they like or dislike a work of art. Students who reported not visiting LACMA or only visiting LACMA once within the past 12 months were more likely to indicate a desire to visit art museums in the future.³ Lastly, female students were more likely to indicate that it was extremely important for students to visit the museum than male students were.

³ Student survey results were statistically significant at the 0.05 level (i.e., 95% chance that the pattern observed is non-random).

III. Case Study: Plasencia Elementary School

Delivery of LACMA Curriculum

Thirteen LACMA sessions were observed at Plasencia Elementary School in November and December 2007. Six sessions were observed in grade 3, four sessions in grade 4, and three sessions in grade 5. In all classrooms, there was clear evidence of student exposure to art and art making. Teaching Artists (TAs) generally began sessions by presenting and encouraging discussion of slides highlighting artwork from the LACMA collection. Students reviewed abstract and representational images to prepare for their hands-on projects creating similar artwork that embodied the theme and/or mediums of those slides viewed from the LACMA collection.

Students viewed work by artists including Ambrosius Bosschaert, Irene Collum, and Pablo Picasso. In a lesson reviewing the work of Irene Collum, students worked on the creation of collage/abstract art by drawing, cutting, pasting, using oil pastels and blending. Students built on previous lessons of drawing and cutting abstract shapes, then gluing the shapes onto colored paper. They then used oil pastels and watercolors to paint over the shapes.

Generally, students were extremely engaged during the sessions. Third grade classes had more difficulty staying on task, following directions, and paying attention during lecture and discussion. Classroom teachers were involved in managing the class and circulating during the students' art project time. Some classroom teachers provided feedback to students on their artwork. Classroom teachers also played a role in maintaining classroom discipline as TAs appeared less confident in their classroom management abilities. In a few classrooms, the classroom teacher participated in the art project, making his/her own collage, which helped model expectations for students.

In all grades observed, TAs worked well with students during the art-making period, providing positive feedback and helping with technique. In the introduction of the art project, TAs demonstrated concepts and techniques to students. However, the success of the modeling varied from class to class. Further explicit step-by-step instructions were needed for classes working on more complex, multi-step projects, which caused confusion among students.

Lessons loosely integrated Visual Arts Standard 1.0: *Perceive and respond to works of art, objects in nature, events, and the environment. Use vocabulary of visual arts (proportion, complementary colors, texture, value, shape, form line) to express observations.* For example, students responded to questions about complementary colors, identified textures, and used other vocabulary terms to describe presented artwork. TAs reinforced vocabulary development linked to art, however concrete linkages to ELA/ELD standards were absent.

Teacher Experiences with LACMA

Teachers at Plasencia Elementary School felt that the LACMA program was critical in its role of bringing arts back into the classroom, where the regular curriculum leaves little room for art. Teachers felt that the overall experience validated the arts as having value, for

both teachers and students. After participating in the program, teachers said that they were motivated to integrate the visual arts into the teaching of ELA and social studies. Teachers also noted that they could reinforce some of the art-related vocabulary into future lessons.

Most of all, the teachers felt that the program enhanced understanding of the visual arts and appreciated seeing a “real artist” teaching projects to their students. Several teachers felt that because they were not artistically inclined, the experience helped generate ideas of how to incorporate art projects into other content areas, now that there has been exposure. Further, the experience gave both students and teachers a foundation for discussing artwork; some teachers felt more comfortable leading students in discussions related to art. Teachers also reported that LACMA resources such as Evening for Educators were useful and materials received were helpful in building a good foundation to use with students.

Teachers described their experiences with TAs as “very good, easy” and “positive.” They felt that the TA had a clear objective and focus, and that the TAs were effective because they knew how to interact with children. The TAs were encouraging and did not make students feel apprehensive because they had an open attitude and were constantly encouraging students to express themselves and that there were no “wrong” answers in art.

Teachers reported mixed responses in their levels of communication with their TAs. Some TAs communicated with teachers and found out what ideas and material to integrate into the LACMA sessions, while others felt there was little opportunity for collaborative involvement. One teacher stated that he would have liked to be more involved instead of supervising and providing classroom management. This teacher felt that working with the TA outside of the session would help students make stronger connections between the LACMA sessions and curriculum from the regular school day.

Overall, Placentia teachers found the LACMA program to be “very very effective” and “absolutely needed.” Teachers felt that such collaborations were critical for change to take place within the education system, in helping students, teachers, and administrators see the value of creative thought. Teachers’ perceptions toward LACMA improved because they viewed the program as LACMA reaching out to a community has not been comfortable viewing or expressing perceptions of visual art. In particular teachers recognized the significance of the LACMA program in schools as parents were unable or unaware of the importance of exposing their children to the arts. Several focus group participants suggested that LACMA provide a bus on the weekends to transport student families to the museum, which would encourage continued interest in the arts and help foster dialogue about art during family interactions.

Teachers enjoyed the curriculum and reported interest in obtaining copies of LACMA lesson plans in order to incorporate or revisit lessons in the future. Teachers also enjoyed the initial meeting with TAs which gave teachers the opportunity to view TA’s portfolios, ask questions, and get to know the artists on a personal level. Classroom teachers stated that they would have liked the opportunity to work with TAs prior to the start of sessions in their classrooms. This would allow the classroom teacher to help connect the content of the LACMA sessions to material covered during the school day, thus bridging California Content Standards to the art lessons.

Student Exposure to Art and Art Making

Students had extremely positive feedback on the LACMA sessions and their TAs. Students reported enjoying learning about artists, various cultures, and creating their own projects. Additionally, numerous students stated that they enjoyed learning various techniques from the TA in creating their art projects.

One teacher reported that students expressed an interest and excitement about being in school, due to participation in the LACMA program. In particular, she reported that one student who had been struggling academically had shown significant interest in the curriculum and became more involved in the classroom, which was spurred by the TA sessions.

Students and teachers also reported an increase in confidence and initiative. TAs consistently impressed upon the students the idea that there is no “right and wrong” in art”, which encouraged students in their self-expression and forming opinions about artwork. Further, students felt they were better able to discuss and reflect on art, now that they had a foundation. In addition to oral discussion, some students were encouraged in their written work as well. In one instance, a student took the initiative to write a letter to her teacher reflecting on her experience working with the LACMA TA. The student’s letter discussed how she enjoyed art history, learning about diverse ancient civilizations, and comparing artwork from other cultures.

Students also enjoyed discussing their artwork at home with their families and encouraging their families to take a trip to the museum. Students stated that after seeing slides from the LACMA collection, they were interested in seeing the original piece. Also, they were interested in learning about other artists, mediums, and gaining new ideas from the artwork. Students also were encouraged to create their own art projects at home, as inspired by work done in class with the TA. Some students brought in pieces created at home to share with the classroom. While many students felt shy or nervous about presenting their work in front of the class, students also stated that they enjoyed the presentations because they were able to learn about others’ processes in creating a piece, as well as gaining new ideas.

Student Impact: Oral Presentations

After completing six contact hours with LACMA TAs, participating students in grades 3-5 at Placentia Elementary School were instructed by PW to involve students in follow-up oral presentations based on art projects completed with the TA. The oral presentations were intended to provide students with an opportunity to demonstrate their knowledge in relation to ELA and Visual Arts standards based on exposure to the LACMA curriculum.

Classroom teachers scored student presentations on a four-point rubric based on California Department of Education’s English Language Arts and Visual Arts standards⁴. A score of a “4” indicates that the student presentation exceeded standards and clearly demonstrated mastery of standards. A “3” indicates that the student met standards. A “2” indicates that

⁴ All participating teachers did not score student presentations utilizing ELA rubric. Thus there were discrepancies between the total number (N) of students scored in relation to Visual Arts standards compared to those scored against ELA standards.

the student only partially met standards. A score of a “1” indicates that the student presentation did not meet standards. Please see Appendix C for copies of rubrics and standards by respective grade level.

Among third grade students, the average score in both Visual Arts and ELA was a “3” (Meets Standards, evidence of clear mastery of most selected standards). One hundred percent of third grade students used visual art vocabulary in their presentations (Visual Arts Standard 1.0). A majority of students (68%) also were able to distinguish and describe representational, abstract and nonrepresentational works of art (Visual Arts Standard 3.3). In ELA Standards, 73% of students spoke in a manner that guided listeners to understand important ideas by using proper phrasing, pitch, and modulation (ELA Standard 1.0). Additionally, 68% of students used clear and specific vocabulary to communicated ideas and establish tone (ELA Standard 1.7). See Table 9 for further detailed information.

Table 9: Student Oral Presentation Scores, Grade 3

Visual Arts		English/Language Arts	
Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=72)	Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=54)
1.0	100%	1.0	73%
3.1	30%	1.2	45%
3.3	68%	1.5	52%
4.2	56%	1.6	35%
		1.7	68%
Average Score=3 (Met Standard)		Average Score=3 (Met Standard)	

Among 4th grade students, the average visual arts presentation score was a “3”. Most (81%) were able to describe how using the language of the visual arts helps to clarify personal responses to works of art (Visual Arts Standard 4.1). Half of the participants used visual arts vocabulary such as “proportion, texture, form, complementary colors” to express observations (Visual Arts Standard 1.0). It is important to note that only one 4th grade class submitted scored oral presentations. The one 4th grade teacher who did submit scoring sheets did not score the presentations in relation to ELA standards (perhaps as an oversight as this was on the backside of the one-page scoring guide). See Table 10 for further detailed information.

Table 10: Student Oral Presentation Scores, Grade 4

Visual Arts		English/Language Arts	
Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=22)	Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=54)
1.0	50%	n.a.	Not scored
3.1	35%	n.a.	Not scored
3.2	0%	n.a.	Not scored
4.1	81%	n.a.	Not scored
4.4	19%	n.a.	Not scored
Average Score=3 (Met Standard)		Not scored	

LACMA Art Programs with the Community Evaluation, 2007-2008

The average student presentation score among 5th grade participants was a “3” in both Visual Arts and ELA. Approximately three quarters of 5th grade students compared the different purposes of a specific culture for creating art (Visual Arts Standard 4.2), and assessed one’s own art, describing changes they would make for improvement (Visual Arts Standard 4.4). In ELA, 73% of students delivered focused, coherent presentations that conveyed ideas clearly and related to the background and interests of the audience (ELA Standard 1.0). Please see Table 11 for further detailed information.

Table 11: Student Oral Presentation Scores, Grade 5

Visual Arts		English/Language Arts	
Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=100)	Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=75)
1.0	50%	1.0	73%
3.0	25%	1.4	27%
3.2	50%	2.2	24%
3.3	25%		
4.2	75%		
4.4	76%		
Average Score=3 (Met Standard)		Average Score=3 (Met Standard)	

IV. Case Study: Garvanza Elementary School

Delivery of LACMA Curriculum

Sixteen LACMA TA sessions were observed in grades 3-5 at Garvanza Elementary School in March and April 2008. Six sessions were observed in grade 3, six sessions in grade 4, and four sessions in grade 5. In all observed sessions, there was clear student exposure to art and art making. Similar to the format at Plasencia Elementary School, TAs began sessions with the presentation of slides from the LACMA collection, encouraging dialogue among students on the image presented. Images were generally abstract and representational works and conceptually prepared students for their art projects scheduled for the session.

Students were presented work by artists including Winslow Homer, Pablo Picasso, Frederic Remington, and William Keefe. In a lesson reviewing the work of Homer and Remington, students viewed techniques artists employed to create heroic images through media such as sculpture and watercolor. In their own projects, students created “heroic” mixed media collages using pencil, pens, watercolor, construction paper, and magazine clippings. As seen in the LACMA slides, students were encouraged to utilize strong geometric shapes in their art projects to connote a sense of strength and power in their works.

Overall, students were engaged during sessions with TAs. Students were observed actively participating in discussions and asking the TA questions about artwork presented. The level of participation from the classroom teacher varied from class to class. Some classroom teachers remained uninvolved and worked on other tasks during the sessions. Others were actively involved helping the TA elicit responses from students, providing feedback on student artwork, and creating their own art projects. All classroom teachers supported TAs by helping maintain order during the session through overseeing and disciplining students. This proved to be extremely helpful as some TAs were not as confident as others in classroom management.

In all observed sessions, TAs had a good rapport with students. During slide presentations and discussion portion of the lesson, TAs ranged in their ability to encourage dialogue and elicit responses from students. In particular, 3rd grade sessions were strong in oral dialogue between the TA and students. In all grades, TAs ranged from lesson to lesson in modeling expectations for students in their art projects. Some lessons proved to be more successful than others with the TA clearly demonstrating step by step how a student would execute the project with necessary skills and concepts. During the art-making portion of the lessons, TAs circulated among students, answering questions, providing feedback, and assisting with technique.

Lessons loosely integrated Visual Arts Standard 1.0: *Perceive and respond to works of art, objects in nature, events, and the environment. Use vocabulary of visual arts (proportion, complementary colors, texture, value, shape, form line) to express observations.* For example, students responded to questions about complementary colors, identified textures, and used other vocabulary terms to describe presented artwork. TAs reinforced vocabulary development linked to art, however concrete linkages to ELA/ELD standards were absent.

Teacher Experiences with LACMA

Overall, participating teachers at Garvanza Elementary School felt positive about their experience with the LACMA program. Teachers felt that visual arts are extremely important for students to learn about and to be integrated into the curriculum. Several teachers stated that they initially did not recognize the importance of the role of arts in education, but now saw the significance after participating in the program. Teachers expressed that they enjoyed having a professional artist come to the classroom to work with students and that they were pleased the TAs knew how to work with student populations.

Some teachers felt more comfortable leading students in discussions about artwork after observing sessions with the TA. One teacher stated that he already attempted to integrate art and discussion into the curriculum due to his previous experience teaching art history. At Garvanza, he integrated cultural context, history, and background of artists into his lessons. However, he felt the program was helpful in reminding him the importance to emphasize art vocabulary and teach artistic elements such as form, line, color wheel, etc. While most teachers felt arts education was important, other arts programs have existed at Garvanza for several years, thus felt that arts in the classroom was not “revolutionary” for teachers at this site. All teachers felt that student dialogue was very important and most teachers felt their students were able to engage more in conversations about art. One teacher stated that her TA did not have enough discussion with students and was not successful in encouraging dialogue.

In terms of experiences with TAs and projects, classroom teachers felt positively about their TAs, but had mixed feelings about the art projects and delivery of lessons. Third grade teachers stated that the two-hour lesson block was the appropriate amount of time and that students “loved” working with the TA. One teacher stated that though she understood the importance of self-expression and that there was no “right or wrong” in art, she felt the process needed to be more structured and students need more direction in execution of their art projects. One 4th grade teacher stated that she felt the art projects needed to be more creative and utilize a greater diversity of materials. However, another 4th grade teacher stated that her students loved the sculpture project in which they had the opportunity to work with clay. Both the teacher and students felt “phenomenal” work was produced and it was a great opportunity to get creative with a medium they were unfamiliar with. Her only concern was the time constraint was somewhat of a barrier during that lesson. Another teacher from a 5th grade class stated that the art sessions felt rushed and not enough time was allotted for the art-making portion. Further, she felt there was “more lecture than hands-on art-making.”

Most classroom teachers liked how LACMA sessions were tied to their school day curriculum. However, one teacher felt that content standards were not addressed in sessions and students did not know what the focus of lessons were. Some teachers also saw an improvement in terms of the TA’s ability to present and explain vocabulary to students, than experienced in the past. One 4th grade teacher stated that the content from session did not “stick” with her students, or that they did not really understand the focus of the lesson. However, she felt the TA did well explaining art and encouraging students to engage in dialogue. She felt it was a very positive experience compared to her previous TA who did not work well with the student population.

When asked for feedback on the structuring LACMA sessions, classroom teachers stated there needed to be more time allotted for art making. Several teachers also stated that art projects were too similar and they would like to have seen their student exposed to materials they were unfamiliar with. Several teachers stated that the transparencies TAs presented were problematic and that in the future TAs should utilize large prints to present work from the LACMA collection, which would allow students to see the work with greater clarity and detail. Almost all teachers agreed that they would prefer having LACMA sessions earlier in the year due to testing scheduled for the latter half of the year, which makes time more scarce and crucial. Further, scheduling session during the beginning of the year would allow the classroom teacher to integrate art concepts throughout the entire school year.

Student Exposure to Art and Art Making

Participating Garvanza students reported having positive experiences with the LACMA program and TAs. In focus groups, students agreed that they enjoyed learning about art history, experimenting with new materials, and learning new techniques. Students unanimously agreed that more time needed to be devoted to the art-making portion of the session. In addition, students learned a new form of self-expression through creating art. One 5th grade student stated, “Sometimes I can’t really describe how I feel, but now I can draw, paint, cut out pictures... things to help express my feelings.” Students also reported that they now had a greater interest in art and showed initiative in creating art projects at home.

Several teachers reported that students have shown a greater interest in art and were able to recognize artists’ work and artistic themes outside of LACMA sessions. In contrast, a 5th grade teacher felt that because art had already been integrated into his curriculum, his students had already received exposure and had prior knowledge of art. Further, he felt that the lessons were not presented from a critical lens and needed to encourage greater analytical thinking processes.

Teachers reported that students performed well when discussing art when asked and prompted, citing oral presentations as an example. However, several teachers stated they have not seen students take initiative in discussing art and making connections from LACMA sessions to other subject areas. Classroom teachers were interested in the opportunity to collaborate with TAs in the lesson planning process to help connect the LACMA lessons to the regular school day curriculum. Teachers also suggested that it would be beneficial for both classroom teacher and students to receive a “background packet” in advance to help familiarize the class with upcoming lessons, artists, art history, vocabulary, etc.

Student Impact: Oral Presentations

Participating LACMA students in grades 3-5 at Garvanza Elementary School completed oral presentations after six contact hours with LACMA TAs. The oral presentations provided students with an opportunity to demonstrate their knowledge of ELA and Visual Arts standards based on exposure to the LACMA curriculum.

Classroom teachers scored student presentations on a four-point rubric based on California Department of Education’s English Language Arts and Visual Arts standards⁵. A score of a “4” indicates that the student presentation exceeded standards and clearly demonstrated mastery of standards. A “3” indicates that the student met standards. A “2” indicates that the student only partially met standards. A score of a “1” indicates that the student presentation did not meet standards.

Among 3rd grade participants, the average score in Visual Arts and ELA was “3” (Meets Standards, evidence of clear master of most selected standards). Ninety-eight percent of third grade students used Visual Art vocabulary in their presentations (Visual Arts Standard 1.0). Ninety-five percent of students compared and describe various works of art that have a similar theme and were created at different time periods (Visual Arts Standard 3.1). In ELA, the 95% of students spoke in a manner that guides the listener to understand important ideas by using proper phrasing, pitch, and modulation (ELA Standard 1.0) and 100% of students connected prior experiences, insights, and ideas to those of a speaker (ELA Standard 1.2). See Table 13 for further detailed information.

Table 13: Student Oral Presentation Scores, Grade 3

Visual Arts		English/Language Arts	
Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=59)	Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=59)
1.0	98%	1.0	95%
3.1	95%	1.2	100%
		1.5	32%
		1.6	24%
		1.7	93%
Average Score=3 (Met Standard)		Average Score=3 (Met Standard)	

Among 4th grade students, the average visual arts and ELA presentation score was a “3”. One hundred percent of students used vocabulary of visual arts to express themselves (Visual Arts Standard 1.0). In ELA, only one 4th grade class submitted oral presentation scores. Among these students, 63% used traditional structures for conveying information (ELA Standard 1.6). Fifty-nine percent of students spoke in a manner that guides the listener to understand important ideas by using proper phrasing, pitch, and modulation (ELA Standard 1.0) and 52% emphasized points in ways that helped the listener follow important ideas and concepts (ELA Standard 1.7). See Table 14 for further detailed information.

⁵ All participating teachers did not score student presentations utilizing ELA rubric. Thus there were discrepancies between the total number (N) of students scored in relation to Visual Arts standards compared to those scored against ELA standards.

Table 14: Student Oral Presentation Scores, Grade 4

Visual Arts		English/Language Arts	
Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=56)	Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=27)
1.0	100%	1.0	59%
3.1	7%	1.2	48%
		1.5	37%
		1.6	63%
		1.7	52%
Average Score=3 (Met Standard)		Average Score=3 (Met Standard)	

The average presentation score among 5th grade students in both Visual Arts and ELA was a “3”. One hundred percent of 5th grade students used vocabulary of visual arts to express their observations (Visual Arts Standard 1.0). In ELA, 100% of students delivered focused, coherent presentations that conveyed ideas clearly and related to the background and interests of the audience (ELA Standard 1.0). Additionally, 100% of 5th grade students delivered informative presentations about an important idea, issue, or event by framing questions to direct the investigation, establishing a controlling idea/topic, and developing the topic with simple facts, details, examples, and explanations (ELA Standard 2.2). Please note that only one 5th grade class submitted ELA oral presentation scores. See Table 15 for further detailed information.

Table 15: Student Oral Presentation Scores, Grade 5

Visual Arts		English/Language Arts	
Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=55)	Standard	% Integrated the Standard into Presentation (N=32)
1.0	100%	1.0	100%
3.1	0%	1.4	13%
		2.2	100%
Average Score=3 (Met Standard)		Average Score=3 (Met Standard)	

V. Conclusions and Recommendations

Program Accomplishments and Benefits

LACMA has implemented their pilot program in eleven elementary and middle schools in LAUSD's Local District 4 over the past two years. Through this program, LACMA has exposed students to the museum's art collection and instilled a greater appreciation for art. Furthermore, LACMA has been able to broaden understanding of what art is and provide students with a foundation for incorporating artistic expression into their everyday lives.

For teachers, the key benefits of the LACMA program identified by the evaluation include:

- Recognition of the importance of the visual arts and a desire to learn more about art.
- A willingness to reinforce arts-related vocabulary and to make other curricular connections that draw on student's exposure to visual arts for future lessons in English/Language Arts and Social Studies.
- Greater comfort in their ability to lead/facilitate a classroom discussion related to art.
- Improved perceptions of LACMA's interest in community outreach and the museum's potential as an educational resource.

For students, the key benefits of the LACMA program identified by the evaluation include:

- Firsthand contact with an adult artist (i.e., someone for whom art is a vocation and not just an avocation)
- Enhanced exposure to art making in multiple artistic mediums (i.e., beyond painting and drawing).
- Increased confidence in their own ability to produce artwork.
- Increased willingness to participate in discussions about art (e.g, expressing themselves in terms of the elements of art in an artwork, use of artistic media, etc.).
- Greater interest in the historical and cultural context of art.
- Higher interest in visiting an art museum.

Recommendations

LACMA's *Art Programs in the Community* is a pilot program intended to be modified and improved so that services can be expanded to a wider range of schools in LAUSD. Some modifications were at the end of 2006-07 drawing, in part, on the evaluation recommendations for improving classroom management during delivery of LACMA lessons and solidifying school-level commitment to the program. In the spirit of a commitment to continuous program improvement, the evaluation makes the following recommendations:

- Link Arts Instruction more explicitly to English/Language Arts (ELA) and English Language Development (ELD) standards. The student population in LAUSD is overwhelmingly Hispanic, with large concentrations of English Learners. In the current climate of high-stakes accountability, schools are under pressure to increase student achievement in relation to ELA/ELD standards which are the most heavily weighted in determining whether or not a school has been successful. Against this backdrop, LACMA would be well-served to make concrete linkages to ELA/ELD standards wherever and whenever possible. The most obvious point of connection

would be a stronger emphasis on structured discussions of artists and artworks as part of the delivery of the curriculum. In particular, more explicit integration could expand opportunities for both verbal expression linked to art lessons. This would require some training for Teaching Artists (see recommendation below) to enhance specific domains of oral language development in English among the students. Linkages might also be manifest in LACMA developing a planned follow-up component for oral presentations of student artwork at the end of the LACMA sessions (whether done by the classroom teachers or LACMA teaching artists). Regardless of the form it takes, linking the Visual Arts standards of the LACMA curriculum to the ELA/ELD standards will help create the type of conditions that will likely be necessary when the LACMA program moves beyond the pilot stage to wider usage in a larger number of LAUSD schools.

- Provide pedagogical training for Teaching Artists. In order to help these instructors more effectively deliver the LACMA curriculum to meet the learning and linguistic needs of students, we recommend some training on research-based instructional strategies. For example, we recommend a mini-institute for Teaching Artists in pedagogical techniques and strategies effective with English Learner students such as the use of non-linguistic representations, use of modified academic language, explicit modeling of assignments, accessing prior knowledge, and anticipatory guides and other teaching organizers to assist students in previewing and categorizing new content. All of these strategies aim to “scaffold” instruction so that students have a greater chance of meeting rigorous standards in English.
- Build in more time for collaboration between classroom teachers and Teaching Artists. The six hours of LACMA’s program is a short “window” in which to accomplish multiple goals. It may behoove LACMA to fund collaboration time between Teaching Artists and classroom teachers prior to the delivery of the curriculum. In this way, a teaching expert and an artist could collaboratively think through the balance of art presentation, discussion about the elements of art and artistic expression, student involvement in art making and student presentation of their artwork. This kind of collaboration would also serve to further clarify the roles and expectations of the two types of instructors during the time allocated for the LACMA program.
- Strengthen the museum-based services. In light of strong teacher and student interest in museum visits, LACMA should consider implementing fieldtrips to the museum as a component of the program. Similarly, the LACMA program might provide transportation to museum for Family Sunday programs.
- Invest in further professional development. To build on strong teacher interest in arts integration, LACMA should consider augmenting the school-based portion of the program with greater involvement of teachers in Evenings for Educators or other professional development targeted to teachers who have been involved in a six-week classroom session of the program. LACMA might consider scheduling some professional development at school sites and/or coordinate with LAUSD Local District 4 to offer professional development to teachers from multiple sites at a single location. In this way, a cadre of teachers would be exposed to additional professional development on integrating the visual arts into classroom instruction.